



TOWN OF OLD SAYBROOK
Historic District Commission

*William Childress, Chairman
Barbara Harms, Vice Chair
Jan Furman, Secretary*

www.oldsaybrookct.gov
302 Main Street
Old Saybrook, CT 06475
860-395-3131

*Diane Aldi DePaola
Laura Gray
Alternate Members
Richard Peters
Alan Cantor
Paul Knierim*

MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING
Tuesday, July 19, 2022 at 7:00 p.m.
Hybrid Meeting
Town Hall 2nd floor conference room
302 Main Street, Old Saybrook

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman W. Childress called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Members Present – William Childress, Barbara Harms, Jan Furman, Diane Aldi DePaola, Laura Gray, Richard Peters, Alan Cantor, Paul Knierim.

Members Absent – None

Staff Present – Lynette Wacker, Assistant Town Planner; C. Maharbiz, HDC Recording Clerk

III. REGULAR BUSINESS

A. Minutes – 6/21/22

MOTION to approve the regular meeting minutes of June 21, 2022, as presented; **Made by:** B. Harms; **Seconded by:** L. Gray; **In Favor:** W. Childress, B. Harms, J. Furman, D. Aldi DePaola, L. Gray; **Opposed:** None; **Abstained:** None. **APPROVED:** 5-0-0.

B. Correspondence – None.

C. Committee, Representative and Staff Reports – L. Wacker stated that she was informed that a structure was put up at 151 N. Cove Rd. She went to the house and found that a pergola was erected attached to an outdoor kitchen, which makes it a structure. She informed the owner that an application must be submitted to HDC.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness as to Exterior Features to replace four first floor double hung windows

148 North Cove Road (Map 32/Lot 59)

Applicant/Agent: Richard Peters

ACTION: Filed 6/15/2022; open public hearing, decision by 8/16/2022 (NLT 8/18/2022).

Applicant Richard Peters explained that he is replacing 4 windows on the first floor on the eastern portion of the house due to rot (2 face the street, 1 faces the neighbor to the east, and 1 faces the backyard which is exempt). The windows that are being proposed as replacements are the same size, same proportion, same design, same muntins, same sills, and same trim. Additionally, the proposed windows match windows that were previously approved. The only difference is that the new windows are made of a hybrid material, which is not a change from what was previously approved, but the windows that are being replaced are all wood. They are colonial style. He also added that it is his opinion that the muntins should not be sandwiched between dual panes, but affixed on the outer glazing.

MOTION to approve the application, **MADE by** J. Furman; **SECONDED by:** D. Aldi DePaola; **VOTED IN FAVOR:** W. Childress, B. Harms, J. Furman, D. Aldi DePaola, L. Gray; **OPPOSED:** None; **ABSTAINED:** None; **APPROVED:** 5-0-0.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness as to Exterior Features to add a 69 s.f. addition.

116 North Cove Road (Map 32/Lot 63)

Applicant/Owner: James & Elena Goggin

ACTION: Filed 6/16/2022; open public hearing, decision by 8/16/2022 (NLT 8/19/2022)

Applicants James and Elena Goggin presented. James Goggin explained that they need a functioning kitchen and came up with a design for a bump out addition. They plan to use the same materials that currently have and the fascia will be carried over to the bump out. The AC unit will be moved and the back wall extended 12 feet. The windows will be Harvey majestic, aluminum clad on the outside with wood on the inside. The cedar siding will be redone and the roofing will match as well.

W. Childress asked if was a contributing house and James Goggin responded that it is not (from 1918). B. Harms asked where the AC compressor will go, to which James Goggin stated that they do not yet know. Elena Goggin further explained that they have hired a landscape designer to help reposition some plants and discussed the possibility of putting a trellis or fencing around the unit once it is repositioned. L. Gray asked if the foundation was brownstone, to which Elena Goggin stated she does not think it is brownstone, but will match what already exists. She also stated that the bump out will be a proper crawlspace with concrete.

Applicant Elena Goggin stated that the kitchen currently has a double casement window and they are proposing splitting up the casement windows, but the material will be the same as what is currently there. With respect to the second floor, they received the recommendation not to keep the same type of awning window they currently have due to problems with water leaks. R. Peters commented that the criteria specify to avoid casements, but his opinion is that the house already has casements and the casements that they are putting back mimic a colonial window. He also stated that normally would not like a landscape window on the second floor, but in this case, there is not much that can be done due to the roof pitch.

Members discussed adding a condition that the muntins be affixed to the exterior surface of the windows as proposed by R. Peters, but decided not to add such a condition. P. Knierim referenced 2016 criteria approved by the Commission discussing the suitability of grids between glass. The Commission did caution the applicants that if they move the AC compressor forward toward the street and decide to screen it, the applicants would need to file an application with the Commission.

For the below vote only, P. Knierim was seated for L. Gray.

MOTION to approve the application, **MADE by** J. Furman; **SECONDED by:** B. Harms; **VOTED IN FAVOR:** W. Childress, B. Harms, J. Furman, D. Aldi DePaola, P. Knierim; **OPPOSED:** None; **ABSTAINED:** None; **APPROVED:** 5-0-0.

C. **Certificate of Appropriateness as to Exterior Features** to install new wood screen door/storm door in front entry and install new aluminum screen/storm door at rear patio entry.

55 North Cove Road (Map 31/Lot 19)

Owner: Abigale & Scott Skidmore

Applicant/Agent: Tony Brodeur, North Cove

Construction

ACTION: *Filed 6/22/2022; open public hearing, decision by 8/16/2022 (NLT 8/19/2022)*

Agent Tony Brodeur presented. He stated that the owners would like to install storm doors in the front and rear. The front storm door will be African mahogany painted white with the smallest rails possible and the rear storm door will be full view aluminum for protection from the weather.

W. Childress asked if the current rear door is aluminum and Mr. Brodeur responded that he believes it is hybrid fiberglass material. Most of the windows have cladding on them that have been replaced, either aluminum or fiberglass. The front wood clad door is very similar to 141 N. Cove.

D. Aldi DePaola asked if both doors should be wood or wood composite based on criteria to which Mr. Brodeur explained that on the water side a wood door would not do well and an aluminum door would last longer. He also stated that he does not know of a storm door that is available made of composite, only full wood or aluminum. From the water side a white aluminum storm door is not going to be different from clad windows that already exist. W. Childress commented that it is a contributing house. Agent Brodeur explained that there is no storm door in the back now and that the full profile of the back door will still be seen.

L. Gray asked if the storm door would be visible if the inside door is open. Agent Brodeur stated that the door does not have a big rail, approximately 2 to 2.5 inches, so it will not take away from the inner door. B. Harms commented that back when the house was constructed, there would not have been a screen door, so she is of the opinion that it is acceptable to use a modern material on a screen door. R. Peters also commented that the door being covered by the storm door is not historic.

L. Gray asked for a description of the front door, which Agent Brodeur explained is full view African Mahogany frame with interchangeable inserts, painted white to blend with the trim. B. Harms asked if they are painting the front door and Agent Brodeur said no.

MOTION to approve the application, **MADE by** J. Furman; **SECONDED by:** D. Aldi DePaola; **VOTED IN FAVOR:** W. Childress, B. Harms, J. Furman, D. Aldi DePaola, L. Gray; **OPPOSED:** None; **ABSTAINED:** None; **APPROVED:** 5-0-0.

D. Certificate of Appropriateness as to Exterior Features to add a transom window and lower existing window on 2nd story, add copper flashing trim to house, add cedar clapboard to dormers and side of house and add baluster deck railing to 2nd story deck. 69 Cromwell Place (Map 32/Lot 56)

Applicant/Owner: Robert & Tamara Laurie

ACTION: Filed 7/5/2022; open public hearing, decision by 8/16/2022 (NLT 9/7/2022)

Applicants Robert and Tamara Laurie presented. Mr. Laurie began by stating that they have three changes/improvements. The first change is the design of the railing on the upper deck of the screened in porch, which is proposed as a prairie style design to match the front gate, and will be similar to the Hart house porch and 191 N. Cove. facing the water. He further stated that this type of design is seen on railings in older homes.

W. Childress asked what style was previously approved, to which Mr. Laurie responded straight rail. W. Childress further asked if there is a door leading out and whether it will be used, to which Mr. Laurie responded affirmatively as to both. W. Childress stated that it will be up to the building inspector whether it will be legally usable.

A. Cantor stated that it is a very distinct design that will be prominent on the home, and should be mindful of that. L. Gray showed pictures of 191 N. Cove railing, which she stated is much simpler. She also showed pictures of the Hart house, which she stated is also simpler. Mr. Laurie explained that because they have to comply with building codes, they could not use the exact style of the Hart house. P. Knierim commented that the railing will be painted so it will be more subtle than in the renderings.

Applicant Laurie discussed the second change, which is to drop the dormer windows on the north facing side by 10 inches in order to enjoy the view from the inside. To stay consistent, the applicants want to add a transom above the window, which will be of identical make, model, texture and divided light as the windows previously approved. Also, once the window is dropped, a copper pan will be added below like what exists at 174 N. Cove Rd. directly across the street.

A. Cantor asked if the applicants are adding a transom because they already own the windows and are trying to make them taller, which Mr. Laurie affirmed.

Applicant Laurie discussed the final change, which is to add cedar shake to the sides and white cedar clapboard to the face of the north and south-facing dormers. This is consistent with other historical homes and he explained that they hired a well-known cedar clapboard

builder to make the new side look uniform. In addition, the applicants explained that they consulted architect Patrick Ahearn, who works on historical homes in Boston and Cape Cod. The west side, or rear of the house, will be cedar shingles.

A. Cantor asked if the vertical plank will be board and batten or flat plank and Mr. Laurie responded that it would be flat. R. Peters asked if the shingles will be painted and Mr. Laurie said they would be not. Mr. Laurie showed pictures of homes by architect Patrick Ahearn with similar dormers as well as a similar railing.

W. Childress expressed his opposition to the railing style and voted for approval of the remainder of the application with the exception of the railing, which should go back to what was previously approved. L. Gray, J. Furman, and D. Aldi DePaola agreed with all of the changes.

MOTION to approve the application with the changes presented, specifically the railing, the transom addition to the windows, the change of position of the windows on the north dormers, the change in the siding material to the north-facing dormers, the change in siding material on the back west-facing side of the house, and the change in siding material to the south-facing dormers, **MADE by** B. Harms; **SECONDED by:** D. Aldi DePaola; **VOTED IN FAVOR:** W. Childress, B. Harms, J. Furman, D. Aldi DePaola, L. Gray; **OPPOSED:** None; **ABSTAINED:** None; **APPROVED:** 5-0-0.

V. **DISCUSSION**

Update of Historic and Cultural Resources section of the Plan of Conservation and Development. Decision made to add this item to the August agenda and discuss at the next meeting.

W. Childress reported that R. Peters has codified the criteria so that applicants can site certain sections on their applications.

VI. **ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 8:42 p.m. until the next regular meeting of Tuesday, August 16, 2022, 7:00 p.m., Old Saybrook Town Hall, 302 Main Street, **MADE by** B. Harms; **SECONDED by:** J. Furman; **VOTED IN FAVOR:** W. Childress, B. Harms, J. Furman, D. Aldi DePaola, L. Gray; **OPPOSED:** None; **ABSTAINED:** None; **APPROVED:** 5-0-0.

Respectfully submitted,
Carolina Maharbiz, HDC Recording Clerk